# **Regional priorities for a** connected learn-andwork ecosystem: Results from the Midwest **Credential Transparency** Survey

Series 1 with Credential Engine







# Moderator



### • Jenny Parks MHEC Vice President



# Presenters



### • Scott Cheney Credential Engine Executive Director

• Jeff Grann Credential Engine Principal Investigator



# Presenters





### • Marcia Black-Watson MI Department of Labor & Economic Opportunity Industry Engagement Division Administrator

# •Ken Sauer

IN Commission for Higher Education

Sr. Associate Commissioner and Chief Academic Officer



### Poll Question #1



#### Credential Engine, Inc.

Update

May 2020



Scott Cheney <u>scheney@credentialengine.org</u> <u>www.credentialengine.org</u> <u>www.credreg.net</u> (technical website)



#### Who We Are

- Non-profit
- Community built
- Data Driven
- Mission oriented around credential transparency

- What We Do
  - Provide common infrastructures
  - Leverage a common language
  - Build and mobilize partnerships
  - Develop and support open technology







### Shared Understanding Across <u>All</u> Credentials



- The market is large and expanding -
- Over 738,000 credentials confirmed in the U.S. alone.
- As many or more competency models / frameworks
- Approximately \$2t spent in the U.S. market annually
- Possibly 40,000+ separate providers / issuers of credentials 7,000 from IPEDS, 500+ licensing bodies, 1000+ certification bodies, 23,000+ apprenticeship programs, thousands of badge issuers
- Our two description languages (schema) for all these credentials and their competencies allow them to be searchable, discoverable and comparable using linked, open, interoperable, machine-actionable data.

| Count of U.S. Postsecondary and Secondary Credential Programs |                  |                            |   |  |  |
|---|------------------|----------------------------|---|--|--|
| Credential Type   | Program<br>Count | Nature of<br>Current Count | Method and Sources  |  |  |
| Total   | 738,428          |                            |   |  |  |
| Postsecondary Educational<br>Institutions                     | 370,020          |                            |   |  |  |
| Title IV Schools – Degrees                                    | 212,802          | Enumeration                | Count – IPEDS   |  |  |
| Title IV Schools – Certificates                               | 111,941          | Estimate                   | Count – IPEDS <u>plus</u><br>Extrapolation from 8 states' lists   |  |  |
| Non-Title IV Orgs. – Degrees                                  | 3,188            | Rough<br>Estimate          | Count – IPEDS <u>plus</u><br>Extrapolation from 8 states' lists   |  |  |
| Non-Title IV Orgs. – Certificates                             | 42,089           | Rough<br>Estimate          | Count – IPEDS <u>plus</u><br>Extrapolation from 8 states' lists   |  |  |
| MOOC Providers  | 7,132            |                            |   |  |  |
| Microcredentials  | 629              | Enumeration                | Count – Class Central   |  |  |
| Degrees from Foreign Universities                             | 28               | Enumeration                | Count – Class Central   |  |  |
| Course Completion Certificates                                | 6,475            | Enumeration                | Count – edX, Coursera, FutureLearn,<br>Kadenze  |  |  |
| Non-academic Organizations                                    | 315,067          |                            |   |  |  |
| Occupational Licenses   | 11,837           | Estimate                   | Count – ETA License Finder <u>plus</u><br>Extrapolation from 10 states' lists   |  |  |
| Industry-recognized Certifications                            | 6,724            | Estimate                   | Count – ETA Certification Finder and<br>program accreditors <u>plus</u> Extrapolation<br>from 3 industry lists          |  |  |
| Military Certifications                                       | 1,378            | Partial<br>Enumeration     | Count – COOL (accredited certificates not in Certification Finder)  |  |  |
| Registered Apprenticeships                                    | 22,488           | Enumeration                | Count – ETA Apprenticeship Registry   |  |  |
| Unregistered Apprenticeships                                  | 50               | Partial<br>Enumeration     | Count – German- and Swiss-American<br>company programs (less Registered<br>Apprenticeships)                             |  |  |
| Coding Bootcamp Course<br>Completion Certificates             | 1,014            | Estimate                   | Count – Coursereport.com (less programs not available in U.S.)  |  |  |
| Online Course Completion<br>Certificates                      | 80,117           | Estimate                   | Sums provided by Udemy, Lynda,<br>SkillSuccess  |  |  |
| Digital Badges  | 191,459          | Enumeration                | Count – badge vendors (Badgr, Credly,<br>Acclaim, LRNG, MyMantle, Participate)  |  |  |
| Secondary Schools   | 46,209           |                            |   |  |  |
| Public School Districts – Diplomas                            | 33,540           | Estimate                   | Count of number of public school districts,<br>by state – CCD Count of number of<br>diploma options, by state – Achieve |  |  |
| Private Schools – Diplomas                                    | 12,669           | Estimate                   | Count of number of private secondary  |  |  |

schools - PSS (Assume one diploma option

### Counting U.S. Postsecondary and Secondary Credentials

https://credentialengine.org/countingcredentials-2019-report/





Compare

\$

#### **Certificate in Pharmacy Technician**

lvy Tech Community College of Indiana

#### Certificate **Basic Info**

| - | a | 3 | • | - |  | • | • |
|---|---|---|---|---|--|---|---|
|   |   |   |   |   |  |   |   |

| Connect to this Credential |  |
|----------------------------|--|
| About this Credential      |  |



prescription interpretation, patient communication and education, safety procedures, record-keeping, measurement and testing techniques, pharmacy business operations, prescription preparation, logistics and dispensing operations, and applicable standards and regulations.

As part of Governor Holcomb's Next Level Jobs initiative, the Workforce Ready Grant program provides free training for working-age Hoosiers in the state's highest demand jobs. These industries have higher median salaried jobs and are rapidly growing in Indiana - including Advanced Manufacturing, Building & Construction, Health & Life Sciences, Information Technology & Business Services, and Transportation & Logistics. For more information, please refer to https://www.nextleveljobs.org/Job-Seeker/Available-Job-Training

#### **Estimated Time to Complete Required Learning Opportunities**

| Estimated nine to complete required Learning Opportunities  | y Chesterfieldo St. Louis  |
|---|--|
| Certificate in Pharmacy Technician  |  |
| Estimated: 8 months   |  |
| Completed in two semesters (21 credit hours)  | olla Evanoville Oversboro  |
| Credential Status Type  | Gonole Wain<br>National Forest                                     |
| Active  | 104 W. 53rd Street, Anderson, Indiana 46013-1502, United States    |
| Credential Type   |  |
| Certificate   | 3501 N. First Avenue, Evansville, Indiana 47710, United States     |
| Learning Delivery Type  | 3701 Dean Drive, Fort Wayne, Indiana 46835, United States          |
| In-Person Online Only   |  |
| Audience Levels   | 1440 E. 35th Av. , Gary, Indiana 46131, United States              |
| Secondary School or Equivalent  | 50 West Fall Creek Parkway, North Drive, Indianapolis, Indiana 462 |
| Subjects  | SU West Fall Creek Parkway, North Drive, Indianapolis, Indiana 462 |
| Anatomy Anatomy and Physiology Health Care Medical Terminology Pharmacokinetics                                       | 50 Walnut Street, Lawrenceburg, Indiana 47025-1836, United Stat    |
| Pharmacology for Health Care Support Pharmacy Pharmacy Technician Pharmacy Technician Experiential Seminar Physiology |  |
| Prescription Safety   | 590 Ivy Tech Drive, Madison, Indiana 47250, United States          |
| Occupations   |  |
| Healthcare Practitioners and Technical Workers, All Other (29-9099.00) Midwives (29-9099.01) Pharmacists (29-1051.00) | 261 S. Commerce Drive, Marion, Indiana 46953, United States        |
| Pharmacy Technicians (29-2052.00)   |  |
| Industries  | 4301 South Cowan Road, Muncie, Indiana 47302, United States        |
| Health Care and Social Assistance (62) Hospitals (622) Offices of Other Health Practitioners (6213) Retail            | 2257 Charter Blud Dichmond Indiana 47274 United States             |

NextLevel Jobs

#### **Location Info** Мар Satellite Cleveland W TIN Peoria ILLINOIS 70 Columbus Springfield Decatur 70 WEST 4 Đ. Lexingtor Map data ©2020 Google Terms of Use Report a map error

6208-5752, United States

#### More Info

#### Competencies 90 Connections

| onnections | Preparation For 1 Credential | <b></b> |
|------------|------------------------------|---------|
|            | Has 1 Common Condition       | <b></b> |
|            |                              |         |

Teaches 90 Competencies

#### **Quality Assurance**

|   | Quality Assurance         | <b>•</b> |
|---|---------------------------|----------|
| 3 | Owner's Quality Assurance | <b></b>  |
|   |                           |          |

#### **Requirements and Recommendations**

| 1               | <b>\$</b>             |          |
|-----------------|-----------------------|----------|
| Estimated Costs |                       |          |
| 2               | Costs                 | <b>+</b> |
| ٦               | Lauria Oraștinia Cast |          |



#### Credential Transparency

- Credential Engine
   Credential Registry
- Open-platform schemas
- and languages

#### Stakeholders and Key Initiatives for a Connected Learn-and-Work Ecosystem



#### Understanding

- **Credentials of Value**
- State identification of credentials of value
- Public-private education/ credentialing data infrastructure
- Credential Registry use in Eligible Training Provider List and other eligibility determinations
- Incremental higher education credentialing system framework
- SocialTech's unmudi.com

#### Employers/Workforce

- Jobs Data Exchange
- Talent Pipeline
- Management Initiative
- Competency/skills/
- competency calibrator
- Hiring for competencies/ skills
- Workforce Partnership
   Initiative

#### 6 Navigation Tools,

- Verification Quality
- Digital learner records
- The Quality Assurance Commons
- Google Education and
- Pathways Search

Messaging about

- **Credentialing System**
- Gallup surveys
- Media messaging
- Research: number of
- credentials







# Emerging Focus Areas....

• Response to Covid-19

--Alabama is including credential transparency in their Covid-19 response plans
--Other states are looking to act as well

 Making open and machine actionable the links between skills/competencies, credentials, and jobs

 Publishing data elements to improve pathways and navigation tools and services





## Scaling Up....

- Being incorporated into / aligned with ETPLs in a growing number of states:
  - Washington, Alabama, New Jersey, Colorado, Michigan, Indiana, Minnesota
     CT Governor signed an executive order calling for credential transparency
     MD and other states are considering legislation
- Aligned with state efforts to better use data to identify credentials of value, especially against state attainment goals
- Being embedded into comprehensive / interoperable learning records (CLR/ILR) work coming out of projects at the White House, IMS Global / AACRAO, and elsewhere
- Working with the Open Skills Stack (WGU, ASU, SAP, IBM, Salesforce, etc.) to publish skills, competencies, and credentials in CTDL / CTDL-ASN to the Registry in machine-readable, linked open data
- Published O\*NET and other industry competency models in CTDL-ASN to make it linked, machine readable data for the first time; working on publishing ESCO (Europe's version of O\*NET)



#### States Policy Partnership









STATE HIGHER EDUCATION EXECUTIVE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION

NCSI



Credential

Engine™



### **Collective Impact**





6









### A Few Notes...

- Public Service Non-Profit We believe that full access to linked, open, transparent data is a public good We are not a "vendor"
- No Fees to Publish Data.
- No Fees for Non-Commercial Use.
- Our language is an open, Creative Commons Licensed schema.
- Our role is NOT to define quality, but to provide appropriate ways to have quality described and determined by appropriate entities (i.e. accreditors, state agencies, etc.).
- We do not collect or track individuals or their data.

#### **Convergence Accelerator Team – Connected Learn & Work Ecosystem**





Jeff Grann (PI)



**Credential Engine** Ken Sauer (Co-PI)

N Commission for Higher Ed



Jenny Parks (SP) ИНЕС

**Emilie Rafal (SP)** 

**Credential Engine** 



A A CLJ

Jillian Scholten (SP) N Commission for Higher Ed

EDUCATION NETWORK

#### Holly Zanville (SP) umina Foundation

INDIANA UNIVERSITY



**AS GLOBAL** 

INDIANA

DEVELOPMEN

Phase 1: Data exchange evaluation criteria, Indiana roadmap, state-level toolkit

Phase 2: Connected data exchanges, new user applications, outcome measures

#### Data Expert Workshop: October - define requirements

Use Case Workshops: November & January - Indiana employers, ed providers, government, & experts





# Midwest Credential Transparency Survey

# 4/27/20 - 5/6/20

#### **Focal areas**

- I. State priorities
- 2. Stakeholders
- 3. Engagement strategies

#### Sample

- MHEC commissioners, alternates, and midwest CE partners
- n = 26 (58% state government, 30% credential providers, 12% non-profits)
- At least one response from each midwest states.





| Priority   | Current | Future | Not a<br>Priority | Don't<br>know |
|--|---------|--------|-------------------|---------------|
| Careers: Help displaced & transitioning workers gain skills for better jobs  | 90%     | 5%     | 0%                | 5%            |
| Planning: Set credential attainment goals by state employment needs (occupational sectors, population sectors, credential types, etc.) | 81%     | 5%     | 10%               | 5%            |
| Quality: Identify high-value credentials (such as certificates, micro-credentials, badges, and degrees) for in-demand occupations      | 67%     | 19%    | 10%               | 5%            |
| Pathways: Identify education and career pathways supported by credentials and required for in-demand industries/occupations            | 76%     | 14%    | 5%                | 5%            |
| Competencies: Identify skills & competencies supported by credentials and required for in-demand industries/occupations                | 38%     | 29%    | 24%               | 10%           |
| Return on Investment (ROI): Measure and track educational outcomes and effectiveness of credentials                                    | 43%     | 38%    | 10%               | 10%           |
| Equity: Ensure equitable opportunities and outcomes for education and training   | 62%     | 19%    | 10%               | 10%           |
| Performance: Meet statewide secondary & postsecondary credential attainment goals  | 85%     | 10%    | 5%                | 0%            |
| Policy: Update state policies and practices supporting workforce, employers, and education providers                                   | 57%     | 19%    | 10%               | 14%           |
|  |         |        |                   |               |



| Priority   | Current | Future | Not a<br>Priority | Don't<br>know |
|--|---------|--------|-------------------|---------------|
| Careers: Help displaced & transitioning workers gain skills for better jobs                          | 90%     | 5%     | 0%                | 5%            |
| Planning: Set credential attainment goals by state employment needs (occupational sectors, pop       | 81%     | 5%     | 10%               | 5%            |
| Quality: Ider<br>and degrees   |         |        | 10%               | 5%            |
| Pathways: In required for Current: Careers and Perfor  | man     | ce     | 5%                | 5%            |
| for in-demar Future: ROI and Competer  | ncies   | S      | 24%               | 10%           |
| Return on Ir<br>effectivenes   |         |        | 10%               | 10%           |
| Equity: Ensi   |         |        | 10%               | 10%           |
| Performance: Meet statewide secondary & postsecondary credential attainment goals                    | 85%     | 10%    | 5%                | 0%            |
| Policy: Update state policies and practices supporting workforce, employers, and education providers | 57%     | 19%    | 10%               | 14%           |
|  |         |        |                   |               |
|  |         |        |                   |               |



| Stakeholder                                      | Currently<br>engaged | Not currently engaged<br>but should be | No need to<br>engage | Don't<br>know |
|--|----------------------|--|----------------------|---------------|
| High school leadership                           | 76%                  | 14%                                    | 0%                   | 10%           |
| College and university faculty                   | 60%                  | 30%                                    | 0%                   | 10%           |
| College and career counselors                    | 67%                  | 19%                                    | 0%                   | 14%           |
| Registrars and administrators                    | 45%                  | 25%                                    | 5%                   | 25%           |
| College and university leadership                | 86%                  | 10%                                    | 0%                   | 5%            |
| Educational technology providers                 | 33%                  | 19%                                    | 14%                  | 33%           |
| Human resource professionals and hiring managers | 43%                  | 43%                                    | 14%                  | 0%            |
| Employer executives                              | 76%                  | 19%                                    | 5%                   | 0%            |
| Non-profit organizations                         | 50%                  | 20%                                    | 5%                   | 25%           |
| State workforce and education agencies           | 95%                  | 5%                                     | 0%                   | 0%            |
| State legislators                                | 76%                  | 19%                                    | 0%                   | 5%            |
| Governor's office representatives                | 86%                  | 10%                                    | 0%                   | 5%            |



| Stakeholder       |                   | Currently<br>engaged | Not currently engaged<br>but should be | No need to engage | Don't<br>know |
|-------------------|-------------------|----------------------|--|-------------------|---------------|
| High school lead  | ership            | 76%                  | 14%                                    | 0%                | 10%           |
| College an        |                   |                      |  |                   | 10%           |
| College ar        |                   |                      |  |                   | 14%           |
| Registrars        | Current: Stat     | anc of               | ncias and                              |                   | 25%           |
| College an        | Guileni. Sta      | le aye               |  |                   | 5%            |
| Educationa        | college           | leader               | rship                                  |                   | 33%           |
| Human res         | •                 |                      | •                                      |                   | 0%            |
| Employer (        | Recruit: HR, fa   | aculty d             | & registrar                            | 'S                | 0%            |
| Non-profit        | •                 | 5                    | 0                                      |                   | 25%           |
| State work        |                   |                      |  |                   | 0%            |
| State legislators |                   | 76%                  | 19%                                    | 0%                | 5%            |
| Governor's office | e representatives | 86%                  | 10%                                    | 0%                | 5%            |

# Findings – Engagement strategies

| Strategies  | Highly<br>effective | Effective | Not very effective | l don't know |
|---|---------------------|-----------|--------------------|--------------|
| Large face-to-face meetings (50 or more             | 5%                  | 50%       | 35%                | 10%          |
| participants)                                       |                     |           |                    |              |
| Small, face-to-face meetings (less than 50          | 40%                 | 50%       | 0%                 | 10%          |
| participants)                                       |                     |           |                    |              |
| Large, virtual or telephonic meetings (20 or more   | 0%                  | 35%       | 40%                | 25%          |
| participants)                                       |                     |           |                    |              |
| Small, virtual or telephonic meetings (less than 20 | 20%                 | 60%       | 0%                 | 20%          |
| participants)                                       |                     |           |                    |              |
| Webinars  | 11%                 | 42%       | 26%                | 21%          |
| Newsletters   | 0%                  | 30%       | 45%                | 25%          |
| Social media  | 6%                  | 39%       | 22%                | 33%          |
| Shared databases and platforms                      | 21%                 | 37%       | 5%                 | 37%          |
| Action teams focused on certain issues and tasks    | 63%                 | 32%       | 0%                 | 5%           |
| Press coverage                                      | 11%                 | 58%       | 21%                | 11%          |



# Findings – Engagement strategies

| Strategies   | Highly<br>effective | Effective | Not very<br>effective | l don't know |
|--|---------------------|-----------|-----------------------|--------------|
| Large face-to-face meetings (50 or more  | 5%                  | 50%       | 35%                   | 10%          |
| participants)         Small, face         participants         Large, virtu         participants         Small, virtu         Small, virtu         participants         Small, virtu         participants         Webinars |                     | Ŭ         |                       | ction        |
| Newsletter<br>Social med<br>Shared dat   |                     |           |                       |              |
| Newsletter<br>Social mec   | 63%                 | 32%       | 0%                    | 5%           |



# 95%

#### MHEC Commissioners interested in Credential Transparency



### Poll Question #2





Credential Transparency in Michigan Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity-Workforce Development

### **Opportunities for Michigan**

- Governor's Sixty by 30 goal to increase the number of residents with postsecondary credentials.
- Connect training programs with certifications.
- Evaluate credentials to meet "industry-recognized" criteria.
- Unify terms across industry, education, and workforce arenas.





### **3 Business Cases**

- 1. Expand Registered Apprenticeships in Michigan
- 2. Enhance Public Workforce Information System
  - Pure Michigan Talent Connect (PMTC)
  - Michigan Education & Career Pathfinder
  - Michigan Training Connect (MiTC)
  - One-Stop Management Information System (OSMIS)
- 3. Define Career Pathways in Michigan



### **Project Status – July 2018 Launch**



#### **Asset Mapping**

- Credentials & Certifications
- Owners, Partners, & Stakeholders

#### **Phased Approach**

#1: State departments issue crucial licenses and certificates required for residents to work in Michigan.

#### Staffing

Grant-funded staff member dedicated 100% to assisting with account creation, data gathering, and credential uploading

#### Technology

Creating API connection to upload credential information

• ~ 6,900 in queue



#### **Marcia Black-Watson**

Industry Engagement Director, WD 517-241-8221

black-watsonm@michigan.gov

# Credential Engine Indiana

Indiana Commission for Higher Education

May 28, 2020

### DATA WE'VE PUBLISHED

- Public Sector:
  - ✓ All 2- and 4-year campuses
  - ✓ All certificate and degree programs at
  - ✓ All levels
- Two Private, Non-Profit Institutions
- 3,000+ Indiana Credentials





INDIANA COMMISSION P

# USE CASE #1: SECONDARY SCHOOLS (HIGH SCHOOLS, DUAL CREDIT PROGRAMS AND CAREER EXPLORATION)

- High School Early College Programs
  - Starting with 31 high schools endorsed by CHE and Center for Excellence in Leadership of Learning (CELL)
  - Connection to postsecondary credentials
- Working with existing and future career exploration software vendors to use data in the Credential Registry



### USE CASE #2: ELIGIBLE TRAINING PROVIDER LIST (ETPL)

- Eligible Training Providers have met specific performance and occupational demand criteria, and undergo an annual application review process
- Indiana's system is called INTraining
- Working to connect this system with Credential Engine Registry
- On hold due to COVID-19



#### INDIANA WIDGET: TRANSFERIN.NET/SEARCH



#### **GOOGLE PATHWAYS APP**

- Launched in Indiana in Dec 2019
- Three pilot sites
- In-demand information
- Alignment with credential descriptors





#### **CONTACT INFORMATION**

#### Ken Sauer, Ph.D.

Senior Associate Commissioner and Chief Academic Officer Indiana Commission for Higher Education 101 W. Ohio Street, Suite 300 Indianapolis, Indiana 46204 317-232-1090 ksauer@che.in.gov

#### **Jillian Scholten**

Director of Academic Affairs and Talent Credentialing Indiana Commission for Higher Education 101 W. Ohio Street, Suite 300 Indianapolis, IN 46204 317-232-1071 jscholten@che.in.gov

# Questions



Submit questions in the questions box.



# **Next Webinars**

# Series 2:

Technology services for a connected learn-and-work ecosystem: Results from the Midwest Credential Transparency Survey

Tuesday, June 2, at 10:00 a.m. CDT Thursday, June 4, at Noon CDT <u>http://mhec.org/events</u>



# Contact

Jenny Parks MHEC Vice President (612) 677-2779 jennyp@mhec.org

